



July 6 2010

RTCA Paper No. 149-10/SC214-027

MINUTES OF THE 10th PLENARY MEETING OF WG-78/SC-214
"Standards for Air Traffic Data Communication Services"

Date	3-7 May 2010
Place	Palma De Mallorca, Spain
Hosted by	Air Europa

The attendees included:

Co-Chairs SC-214/WG-78

Danny Van Roosbroek EUROCONTROL
Paul Mettus Lockheed Martin Corporation

Secretary SC-214/WG-78

Jane Hamelink Thane, Inc.

Members (Present)

Chris Adams EUROCONTROL
William Adams Federal Aviation Administration
Gregg Anderson Federal Aviation Administration
Stephen Beamer Federal Aviation Administration
Randy Bone MITRE
Willem Brondsema EUROCONTROL
Chris Collings Harris Corporation
Andy Colon Federal Aviation Administration
Jerome Condis Airbus France
Joseph d'Hedouville Thales
Kathy DeVito THANE, Inc.
Bruce Eckstein ITT Corporation
Bernard Gayraud DSN
John Gonda, III MITRE Corporation/CAASD
Jane Hamelink THANE, Inc.
Eric Harrell ARINC Incorporated
Jim Harwood Harris Corporation
Mike Jackson Honeywell International, Inc.
Kathleen Kearns SITA
Paul Kou Dassault Aviation
Tom Kraft Federal Aviation Administration
Thierry Lelievre ALTRAN Technologies
Olivier Lezerat Airbus France

Jordi Manzano	Air Europa
Rob Mead	The Boeing Corporation
Paul Mettus	Lockheed Martin Corporation
Robert Morgenstern	MITRE
Mike Murray	Federal Aviation Administration
Thomas Mustach	Federal Aviation Administration
Laurence Mutuel	Thalse Airsystems
Dung Nguyen	The Boeing Corporation
Madhu Niraula	Rockwell Collins
Andrew Onken	ARINC Incorporated
Thomas Parmer	Federal Aviation Administration
Dijana Pasic	EUROCONTROL
Frederic Picard	Egis Avia Sofreavia
Alex Pufahl	Jeppesen
Pascal Rohault	Thales Airsystems
Juan Rossello	Air Europa
Greg Saccone	The Boeing Company
David Schramm	Honeywell
Jerry Smith	THANE, Inc.
Fred Studenberg	Rockwell Collins
Curtis Talbott	Rockwell Collins
Petr Tieftrunk	Honeywell
Rip Torn	ALPA/IFALPA
Danny Van Roosbroek	EUROCONTROL
Hartmut Villwock	DFS Deutsche Flugsicherung GmbH
Chris Wargo	Mosaic ATM
Katie Younkin	The Boeing Corporation

In accordance with the Federal Advisory Committee Act, Gregg Anderson, Federal Aviation Administration (FAA), was the designated Federal Representative for this meeting.

1. Plenary 10 Welcome/Introductions and Administrative Remarks

Jose Guardiola, Air Europa Training Manager, welcomed members to Plenary 10 in Palma de Mallorca. Jordi Manzano, Air Europa, presented the logistics for the meeting. Juan Rossello, Air Europa, presented a summary of the Air Europa data link activities. See *Air Europa Data Link Activities.ppt*. under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers Danny Van Roosbroek (European co-chair), introduced the meeting. Each attending member introduced himself/herself. (Attendance listed above.) Paul Mettus outlined the agenda for the week.

2. Review and Approval of Plenary 10 Agenda

The Plenary 10 Agenda was presented and approved as follows:

1. Welcome/Introduction/Administrative Remarks.
2. Approval of the Agenda
3. Approval of the Minutes of Plenary 9
 - a. Review Action Item Status
4. Coordination Activities
 - a. Briefing from SC217/WG44 (D-TAXI, Airport Data Base)
 - b. Briefing from SC186/WG51 (CPDLC support for Interval Management)
5. Review of the Work So Far
 - a. SPR and Interoperability documents version H
 - b. SC-214/WG-78 TORs and Work Plan
 - c. Request from SC186/WG51 for CPDLC messages in support of IM
6. Review of Position Papers

- a. DO306/ED122 Amendment for ITP Final (Airbus/Boeing)
- b. Seamless ATS Datalink (Airbus)
- 7. New Sub-Groups Organization
 - a. Announcement of Subgroup Chairs
 - b. Approval of Organization and Process
 - i. Configuration Sub-Group (CSG-SG)
 - ii. Validation Sub-Group (VSG-SG)
 - iii. VDL Sub-Group (VDL-SG)
- 8. Review Contributions
- 9. Approval of Sub-Group Meeting Objectives
- 10. Configuration Sub-Group Report and Assignment of Action Items
- 11. Validation Sub-Group Report and Assignment of Action Items
- 12. VDL Sub-Group Report and Assignment of Action Items
- 13. Review Dates and Locations Upcoming Meetings
- 14. Any Other Business
- 15. Adjourn

3. Approval of the Minutes of Plenary 9

The Plenary 9 minutes were approved without modification.

4. Coordination Activities

4.1 Coordination with SC217/WG44 (Graphical D-TAXI)

- Coordination has been on-going since 2009
- Purpose is to identify the mechanism to exchange references to Airport Map data base in support of D-TAXI graphical capability
- WG44/SC217 and WG78/SC214 Tiger Team is being established
- Draft Charter will be reviewed this week
- Proposal for Co-lead 78/214 : Matt Johnson (FAA); additional members for 214/78 will be identified
- May need to address interim as well as long-term solution for graphical capability
- Scope of collaboration will be addressed this week

4.2 Request from SC186 to include CPDLC messages for Interval Management

- Randy Cook from SC186/WG51 made a presentation to Plenary 10 on Interval Management Work. See *SC-186 FIM-S Data Link Request- SC214 and WG78 plenary briefing.pptx* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.
- Concern was raised on splitting requirements between 2 documents (this will be reassessed as work progresses)
- **Action [AP10-1]:** Jane and Randy to work out new CPDLC messages

5. Review of the Work So Far

5.1 SPR and Interoperability documents version H

- Version H for the SPR and Interoperability documents will remain the baseline for the validation effort
- Version I is an on-going draft collecting resolution to comments

5.2 SC-214/WG-78 TORs and Work Plan

- See Issue [IP5-1], in Chapter 9.

5.3 Request from SC186/WG51 for CPDLC messages in support of IM

- See 4.2 above

6. Review of Position Papers Input to Plenary 10

- Danny Van Roosbroek provided an overview of all material input to the Plenary 10 meeting. See slides 1 and 2 of *SC214-78 Plenary 10 0_D* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers. After discussion, it was agreed that, position papers submitted to the plenary list at least 2 weeks before the meeting, are accepted as such. Late papers, on which no decisions can be taken during the plenary, are recorded under Contributions on the Committee web site.
- Jerome Condis presented the proposed DO306/ED122 Amendment for ITP. See “*DO306-ED122 Change 1 Plenary 10 v2*” under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers. Comments, within the ITP scope, have been received from Greg Mc. Donald (Air Services) and Rip Thorn (Alpa); resolutions have been agreed with the authors. Additional comments, beyond the ITP change scope, were submitted by Tom Mustache and Tom Kraft (FAA Certification) paper; they were forwarded to the CSG Sub Group for review as part of the Oceanic/Continental SPR integration discussion

Decision [DP10-1]: DO306/ED122 will only be modified for inclusion of ITP and released for the FRAC process.

Decision [DP10-2]: Any changes identified against DO306/ED122 other than the ITP change agreed above will be made in the converged SPR.

Decision [DP10-3]: The schedule for the FRAC of DO306/ED122 Change 1 is agreed, as shown in slide 7 of “*DO306-ED122 Change 1 Plenary 10 v2*” under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

- Jerome Condis presented Seamless ATS Datalink paper. See *WG78-SC214 Plenary 10 POS Seamless transition* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

Action [AP10-2]: When both the ground and aircraft are dual stacked, the CSG will develop guidance on what interoperability mechanisms (in terms of ATN or FANS) should be used.

Issue [IP10-1]: When both the aircraft and the Ground system are dual stacked, will any requirements be levied on the FANS part of the ground systems?

Further discussions on this topic were forwarded to the CSG SG..

7. New Sub-Groups Organization

- CSG co-chairs: Jane Hamelink and Thierry Lelievre
- VSG co-chairs: Jerome Condis and Greg Saccone
- VDL2 co-chair: Rob Morgenstern

8. Review of Contribution Papers

8.1 Seamless ATS Transfers

This paper presents information on a Boeing patent on seamless transfers. See *Seamless ATC Patent* under *Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers*. This paper will be addressed by the ad hoc management group during this week.

8.2 SPR Analysis of D-TAXI

This paper presents an assessment of D-TAXI messages. See *POS PL SPR analysis of DTAXI* under Plenary 10 Contributions. This paper will be addressed by the CSG for messages and the 44/217 tiger team for graphic information.

8.3 Draft Charter of WG44/SC217

This paper presents a proposal for establishing a joint tiger team between WG44/SC217 and WG78/SC214 to address graphic taxi. See *Taxi Clearance WG44 WG78 Tiger Team v1.1* under *Plenary 10 Contributions*. This paper will be updated by the ad hoc management group during this week and discussed on Wednesday in a telecon with WG44/SC217.

8.4 Update of 306/122 Based on Gold Document

This paper proposes changes to 306/122 based on the GOLD document. See *POS-PL-Update_DO-306&ED-122 based on ICAO GOLD and Annex A with proposed revisions under Plenary 10 Contributions*. This paper will be addressed by the CSG under the oceanic continental integration work.

8.5 Safety Issues on FANS Accommodation

Wim Brondsema presented a paper expressing concerns on safety issues for FANS accommodation. See *Safety issues FANS accommodation under Plenary 10 Contributions*. This paper will be addressed in the CSG safety and performance work.

8.6 DFS SESAR Activities

Hartmut Villwock presented information on DFS SESAR activities for information to the meeting. See *DFS SESAR under Plenary 10 Contributions*.

8.7 Air-Ground Communications Security

Andy Colon presented information on the FAA security position. See *FAA DCP Air Ground Security and FAA_DCP_Security_Paper_May_3_2010_Final.doc* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

Presentation Summary:

- FAA is developing its security position
- Security will be a planned product improvement of the final release of the FAA Segment 1 Ground Automation System
- The threat assessment done by FAA cannot be shared with other countries

Discussion summary:

- FAA security position is not generic, its linked specifically to OSI
- Security is only applicable to 214/78 aircraft (and will not affect FANS A/C)
- Backward compatibility is an issue
- Publication of 214/78 is dependent on a conclusion of 9880 ICAO WG-M security issue

Action [AP10-1]: CSG/Thierry and Greg Saccone are tasked to determine the impact of security, if any, on SC214/WG78 documents.

9. Status of Actions and Issues

Action [AP8-1]: CSG to develop traceability between ATS Functions and OR/SR/PR after completion of oceanic integration.

Status: Open: To be commenced after oceanic integration (start June 2010).

Action [AP9-2]: The Change package for ED122/DO306 is ready and will be released, after confirmation that a particular change in the GOLD document has no impact on the Change Package.

Action [AP9-4]: There is one resolution in the update of the GOLD document that may impact the Change 1 document of ED122/DO306. Jerome and Katie to assess this and provide an update of the Change 1 paper, if needed, by Plenary 10.

Status: Both Closed: Jerome and Katie briefed plenary on change package, is not impacted by the updated GOLD document. Resolutions to comments received from Greg Mc. Donald (Air Services) and Rip Thorn (Alpa) will be included in *DO306-ED122 Amendment for ITP.doc* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

Action [AP8-4]: Paul Mettus and Danny Van Roosbroek to take the necessary steps to send out a *Call for Interest* via the RTCA PMC and EUROCAE council.

Status: Open: Informally for RTCA/FAA a Call for interest has been issued; formal Eurocae call for interest will be issued after Eurocae approval which is expected June 2010.

Action [AP6-6]: Jose and Tom to prepare a paper to raise the need to update DO264/ED78A. The paper will recommend that DO-264/ED-78 be revised to expand the scope of the OSA to address CNS/ATM, not just data link. The OPA should be removed and further developed in ICAO Doc 9869, Manual on RCP, as this document is more mature than the material provided in DO-264/ED-78A. Validation of OPA material should be based on current implementation efforts for RCP 240 and RCP 400. Performance for surveillance capability should also be progressed in ICAO.

Status: Closed.

Issue [IP5-1]: TORs are not yet approved.

Status: Open: RTCA has been briefed on proposed TORs. An out-of-cycle approval is expected. Danny Van Roosbroek presented modified TORs to the TAC (Technical Advisory Committee to the EUROCAE Council) committee. Cfr *EUROCAE WG78 Revised TORs 2_0 and TAC38 WG78 April 2010* under Plenary 10 Contributions. The only contentious issue for the TAC is inclusion of VDL2 update task. RTCA PMC has approved inclusion of VDL2 work in SC214. RTCA PMC raised concern on inclusion of DTAXI graphic capability.

Action [AP9-2]: Gregg to provide a paper including a proposal to start Oceanic/Continental Integration.

Status: Closed. Gregg has sent out an invitation for and received confirmation from several individual oceanic experts for participation in task. A paper outlining the proposed approach for the oceanic integration approach has been prepared. See *POS-PL-SPR Oceanic Integration Approach 30 April* under Plenary 10 Contributions.

10. Configuration Sub-Group (CSG) Report

Thierry Lelievre (co-chair CSG sub-group) presented a report on the work of the CSG. See *SC214-WG78 - Plenary#10 - CSG Input Progress Report* and *SC214-WG78 CSG Progress Report* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

- 10.1 FANS accommodation

- Decision [DP10-4]:

- Safety and performance requirements must be technology independent (e.g, cannot assume ATN or FANS)
- Interoperability documents must be validated to determine that they provide viable solution to satisfy the SPR

- 10.2 Seamless transition (to/from FANS-ATN airspace)

- **Action [AP10-3]:** Jerome will update the Seamless Transition Paper for June WG meeting
- **Action [AP10-4]:** Everyone to review Jerome's paper

- 10.3 Oceanic Integration

- **Action [AP10-5]:** Tom M will provided GOLD updates for oceanic integration
- **Action [AP10-6]:** Tom M, Jerry, Thierry, and John to update environment characteristics
- **Action [AP10-7]:** Wim and Kathy to work on integration of Oceanic Safety and Performance material

It was noted that the Oceanic integration approach will require Plenary approval. (After meeting note: The safety requirements of the existing ED122/DO306 document will be kept as such in the integrated document, together with the safety requirements of the continental SPR 0.H version.)

- 10.4 D-FIS addressing

- **Action [AP10-8]:** F Picard to update FIS addressing proposal

- 10.5 D-FIS D-HZWX

- **Action [AP10-9]** Wim review safety requirements and update requirements
- **Action [AP10-10]:** CSG to delegate 214/78-206/76 Tiger Team to assess maturity of D-WVR and D-SAR to determine if they should remain in 214/78 SPR

- 10.6 CSG Next Steps

- Develop Version I of the SPR including:
 - Converged SPR
 - Resolved PDRs
 - D-RVR/D-HZWX OSD/OSA/OPA
 - Seamless Operations
 - Interval Management
- Perform SPR Traceability

It was stated that the discussion on the Standards traceability activities (planning, deliverables) was planned on this Friday within the CSG.

11. Validation Sub Group (VSG) Report

Greg Saccone (co-chair VSG sub-group) presented a report on the work of the VSG. See *VSG P10 outbrief* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

- VSG agreed to common validation objectives (VO) approach
- Established process to handle changes to SPR due to validation work
- Established process for assessing requirements:
 - Maturity
 - Criticalness
 - Shared between SPR and interoperability requirements

Issue [IP10-2]: External validation efforts go up to and through 2012; will this affect our due dates (2011)?

John Gonda presented the progress on the assessment of SPR operational requirements (ORs) in light of validation objectives. See *VO_OR_Progress_05_06_10* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

- VSG agreed to common validation objectives (VO) approach
- Validation work will be for both environments A and B

Kathy Devito briefed on the safety and performance validation objectives. See *Plenary #10 Meeting - SPT Outbrief V100506A* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

- **Status**
 - Draft SVOs and PVOs constructed through top-down process
 - Tiered VO structure (sub-objectives exist for some SVOs/PVOs)
 - Draft Document with candidate section material for Validation Plan
- **Working Files**
 - VSG-SPT Validation Objectives V0.3
 - VSG-SPT Tracker File (actions, decisions, comments, topic lot)
 - OSA-OPA Analysis File V0.1
- **Next Steps**
 - Trace of SR/PR to VOs (ensure completeness)
 - OSA-OPA Analysis
 - Validation means, maturity, criticality
 - Internal OSA-OPA horizontal and vertical traces
 - Drafting of additional Plan Sections (e.g., KPAs/KPIs)

Frederic Picard briefed on validation objectives for the interoperability documents. See *INTEROP-VO-Input Status-at-P10* and *INTEROP-VO-Status* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

- Validation Domains have been defined
- Link 2000+ backward compatibility validation
- Out of scope for interoperability validation
 - Operational validation
 - Oceanic services
 - Non mature enough services –D-HZWX, IM, ...
 - Future enhancements (e.g., security, IP...)
- Technical validation objectives have been defined
- Interoperability documentation validation objectives have been defined

12. VDL Sub-Group Report

Rob Morgenstern (co-chair VDL sub-group) presented a report on the work of the VDL subgroup. See *VDL2SG-OutBrief* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

- Update MASPS for multi-frequency operation
- Update MOPS for multi-frequency operation
- Coordinate with other standards bodies as appropriate
 - ACP WG-M
 - AEEC DLK Systems SC
 - LIT

13. Ad-Hoc Subgroup Report

Paul Mettus presented a report on the work of the adhoc subgroup: See *slide 6 of SC214-78 Plenary 10_0_D.ppt* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

13.1 Graphical D-TAXI

The adhoc subgroup reviewed and updated a draft charter for a WG44/SC217 and WG78/SC214 Tiger Team. See *Taxi_Clearance_WG44-WG78_Tiger_Team v1 1_comments_214_78 - revised May 05th* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

13.2 Response to SC186 for their work

The adhoc subgroup prepared and presented a response to SC186/WG51 for work on Interval Management Work. See *2010-04-16 SC186 and SC214 ISRA-186 Plenary approved response* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

Decision [DP10-5]: Plenary approved adhoc group prepared response to SC186/WG51.

13.3 Seamless transfer

Paul reported that Boeing is in the process of trying to release their patent on seamless ATC transition.

14. Any Other Business

Future meetings dates were discussed in particular the addition of Berlin in 2011. See the planned meetings *slide 7 of SC214-78 Plenary 10_0_D.ppt* under Plenary 10 Presentations and Working Papers.

The group thanked Air Europa for their welcome and excellent support.

All the papers referred to in these minutes can be downloaded from <http://www.faa.gov/go/sc214>

Jane Hamelink
Secretary, SC-214/WG-78

CERTIFIED as a true and accurate summary of the meeting.

Paul Mettus
Co-Chairman, SC-214/WG-78

Danny Van Roosbroek
Co-Chairman, SC-214/WG-78